Specification, Estimation, and Analysis of Macroeconometric Models

Specification, Estimation, and Analysis of Macroeconometric Models

Ray C. Fair

Harvard University Press Cambridge, Massachusetts, and London, England 1984 Copyright © 1984 by the President and Fellows of Harvard College All rights reserved Printed in the United States of America $10 \ 9 \ 8 \ 7 \ 6 \ 5 \ 4 \ 3 \ 2 \ 1$

This book is printed on acid-free paper, and its binding materials have been chosen for strength and durability.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Fair, Ray C. Specification, estimation, and analysis of macroeconometric models.

Bibliography: p. Includes index. 1. Econometrics. 2. Macroeconomics—Mathematical models. I. Title. HB141.F34 1984 339.5'0724 83-12901 ISBN 0-674-83180-2 (alk. paper) To my children, Emily and Stephen, without whom considerable time would have been saved in completion of this book but so much joy lost The beginnings of this book go back to my graduate student days, and thus my indebtedness to others is substantial. My thesis advisers at MIT, Robert Solow, Franklin Fisher, and Edwin Kuh, were important in shaping my research interests. Later, at Princeton University, I benefited greatly from my association with Gregory Chow, Stephen Goldfeld, and Richard Quandt. Although what is commonly referred to as "Yale macro" is quite different in emphasis from my own work (see the discussion in Section 3.1.1), I have clearly profited from the lively and stimulating environment at Yale University.

Regarding the work for this book, I am indebted to Barry Bosworth, Gregory Chow, Angus Deaton, William Parke, Peter Phillips, and John Taylor for comments on various drafts. Part of the work in Chapter 6 was done jointly with William Parke, and much of that in Chapter 11 was done jointly with John Taylor. I am also grateful to a number of students, in particular to Lewis Alexander and Tae Dong Kim, for helpful comments. None of these individuals should, of course, be held accountable for the material; all errors are mine. Christopher Baum and Jack Ciccolo provided considerable assistance in the use of the VAX computer at Boston College. Glena Ames, as usual, provided outstanding typing; all the tables in this volume were typed by her. Much of my research, including the work for this book, has been funded by the National Science Foundation (current grant number SOC77-03274).

Contents

1	Introduction	1
	Guide to the Book 5 Conventions Adopted 5 Computer Work 7 References 9	
2	Macroeconomic Methodology	10
	Macro Theoretical Models and the Role of Theory 10 The Transition from Theoretical to Econometric Models 18 Testing Theoretical Models 26 Expected Quality of Macroeconometric Models in the Long Run 28 Nonlinear Optimization Algorithms 28	
3	A Theoretical Model	35
	The Single-Country Model 35 The Two-Country Model 97	
4	An Econometric Model	103
	The United States (US) Model103The Multicountry (MC) Model152	
5	Other Econometric Models	199
	An Autoregressive Model 199 Two Vector Autoregressive Models (VAR1US and VAR2US) 200 A Twelve-Equation Linear Model (LINUS) 201 Sargent's Classical Macroeconomic Model (SARUS) 204	
6	Estimation	208
	Introduction 208 Treatment of Serial Correlation 208 Estimation Techniques 210	

Sample Size Requirements for FIML and the Estimation of Subsets of Coefficients 224
Computational Procedures and Results 227
Comparison of the OLS, 2SLS, 3SLS, FIML, LAD, and 2SLAD Results for the US Model 241

248

Solution

7

	Definition of Terms 248 The Gauss-Seidel Technique 249 Stochastic Simulation 252 Subjective Adjustment of Models 256 Computational Results 257	
8	Evaluating Predictive Accuracy	261
	Introduction 261 Evaluation of Ex Ante Forecasts 262 Evaluation of Ex Post Forecasts 264 A Method for Evaluating Predictive Accuracy 265 A Comparison of the US, ARUS, VAR1US, VAR2US, and LINUS Models 275 A Comparison of the MC and ARMC Models 295	
9	Evaluating Static and Dynamic Properties	301
	Introduction 301 Use of Deterministic Simulations 301 Use of Stochastic Simulations 303 Properties of the US Model 305 Properties of the MC Model 325	
10	Optimal Control Analysis	352
	Introduction 352 A Method for Solving Optimal Control Problems 352 Use of Optimal Control Analysis to Measure the Performance of Policymakers 358 Solution of an Optimal Control Problem for the US Model 364	

11 Models with Rational Expectations

Introduction 369 A Solution Method 371 FIML Estimation 381 Solution and Estimation Using Stochastic Simulation 383 Solution of Optimal Control Problems for Rational Expectations Models 385 Results for a Small Linear Model 386 Results for the US Model with Rational Expectations in the Bond and Stock Markets (USRE1 and USRE2) 390 Results for Sargent's Model (SARUS) 399

12 Conclusions

405

Methodology 405 Specification 405 Estimation and Analysis 408 Rational Expectations Models 410

Appendix A Data and Identities for the United States Model 413
 Appendix B Data and Identities for the Multicountry Model 443
 Appendix C The Fair-Parke Program for the Estimation and
 Analysis of Nonlinear Econometric Models 455
 Notes 461
 References 467
 Index 477

Specification, Estimation, and Analysis of Macroeconometric Models

Abbreviations

ARMC	Autoregressive model (MC)
ARUS	Autoregressive model (US)
BFGS	Broyden-Fletcher-Goldfarb-Shanno nonlinear maximization algorithm
DFP	Davidon-Fletcher-Powell nonlinear maximization algorithm
DW	Durbin-Watson statistic
Fed	Federal Reserve Bank of the United States
FFA	Flow of Funds Accounts
FIML	Full information maximum likelihood
FSR	First-stage regressor
LAD	Least absolute deviations
LHS	Left-hand side
LINUS	A twelve-equation linear model (US)
MAE	Mean absolute error
MC	Multicountry
NIA	National Income and Product Accounts
OLS	Ordinary least squares
RHS	Right-hand side
RMSE	Root mean squared error
SARUS	Sargent's classical macroeconomic model (US)
SE	Estimated standard error of an equation
S&L	State and local
US	United States
USREI	US model with rational expectations in the bond market
USRE2	US model with rational expectations in the bond and stock markets
VAR1US	Vector autoregressive model 1 (US)
VAR2US	Vector autoregressive model 2 (US)
2SLAD	Two-stage least absolute deviations
2SLS	Two-stage least squares
3SLS	Three-stage least squares

3. A Theoretical Model

The single-country model in Section 3.1 is similar to the model in Fair (1974d). The main differences between the two models are the following. (1) The earlier model took account of both labor and loan constraints, whereas the present model considers only labor constraints. I have been unable to find in my empirical work much evidence of the effects of loan constraints on the economy, and this is the main reason they have been dropped from the theoretical model. Eliminating the loan constraints greatly simplifies the model. The household and firm maximization problems are easier to specify, and it is no longer necessary to specify a maximization problem for banks. If financial markets always clear, as is assumed here, banks can be specified to play a passive role in the economy. In the earlier model a rather complicated model of bank behavior had to be specified to explain the possible existence of credit rationing. Also, a bond dealer had to be postulated in the earlier model, which is now no longer necessary. (2) The model of household behavior now includes another decision variable, the amount of time spent taking care of money holdings. It provides a choice-theoretic explanation of the interest sensitivity of the demand for money. (3) Some slight changes in the specification of adjustment costs in the model of firm behavior have been made. (4) An option has been added to allow monetary policy to be endogenous, which is to postulate the possible existence of an interest rate reaction function of the government. In my empirical work I have estimated and used such a function, and it is now part of the theoretical model. (5) The length of the decision horizon for the solution of the household and firm maximization problems is now taken to be three rather than thirty. This change lessens the cost of solving the model, and it allows more accurate algorithms to be written. The first-order conditions have been obtained explicitly for the household problem, and a more accurate algorithm has been written for the firm problem. The cost of solving the earlier model was large enough to require that a "condensed" version of the model be used for many of the simulations. In the present case a condensed version is not needed. The use of three periods is enough to capture the multiperiod nature of the maximization problems, so nothing is really lost by lessening the length of the horizon. (6) Because of the foregoing changes, the values used for the parameters and variables in the simulation work are generally different between the two models. This is not very important, however, because the only things of interest from the simulation experiments are the qualitative results.

The discussion of the class of rational expectations models in Section 3.1.7 is similar to that in Fair (1978c). The discussion in this paper relied on a "static-equilibrium" version of the basic model in Fair (1974d). I have not used this version in the present case. The main points about the class of rational expectations models can be made without reference to this version, of which I have never been particularly fond. It is an attempt to collapse the basic version, which is dynamic and has disequilibrium features, to one with no dynamics and no disequilibrium. So much of the basic version is lost in this process, however, that the resulting model is not very useful for comparison purposes.

The two-country model in Section 3.2 is similar to the theoretical model in Fair (1979a). In this paper a "quasi-empirical" two-country model was also presented, which consisted of my US econometric model linked to a model exactly like it. This model, which was called Model A, has not been used here. I look on Model A as a help in the transition from the theory to the multicountry econometric model in Chapter 4, but it is now no longer of much interest.

Although this note has concentrated on the differences between the models in Sections 3.1 and 3.2 and those in Fair (1974d) and (1979a), the general premises and main features are the same. In particular, the discussion of the models in Sections 3.1.1 and 3.2.1 pertains to both the earlier work and the present work.

4. An Econometric Model

The US model in Section 4.1 is similar to the model in Fair (1976), with the addition of the interest rate reaction function in Fair (1978b). The idea that firms may at times be off their production functions and hold excess labor, which is part of both the theoretical and econometric models, was first explored in Fair (1969). The employment and hours equations in Section 4.1.5 are similar to those in this earlier work. The specification of the production equation has been in part influenced by the results in Fair (1971a).

The US model has been updated and changed slightly over the years, but the basic structure and features have remained the same. One of the more important minor changes that has been made is the imposition of the real wage constraint in Section 4.1.5. A change that expanded the size of the model, but otherwise had little effect, was the disaggregation of the government sector into federal and state & local.

The US model is not a revised or extended version of my original forecasting model (Fair 1971b). The only stochastic equation that is similar between the two models is the employment equation, which, as just noted, is derived from the work in Fair (1969). The forecasting model was intended to be used for very short run forecasting purposes, which meant that a number of expectations variables, such as a variable measuring plant and equipment investment expectations, were taken to be exogenous. In this sense the forecasting model is not structural, whereas the US model is.

The MC model in Section 4.2, aside from the trade share equations, is presented in an unpublished working paper (Fair 1981a). The model in this paper took trade shares to be exogenous. The endogenous treatment of trade shares in Section 4.2.6 is new. This treatment is different from an earlier one presented in another unpublished working paper (Fair 1981b), where constraints were imposed on the coefficients across equations.

5. Other Econometric Models

The discussion of Sargent's model in Section 5.4 is similar to the discussion in section II in Fair (1979c). An iterative 2SLS procedure was used in this paper to estimate Sargent's model, but this has not been done here. A much better technique for rational expectations models is full information maximum likelihood (FIML), and it is now possible to estimate Sargent's model by FIML. This is discussed in Chapter 11.

6. Estimation

The method discussed in Section 6.3.2 for the linear-in-coefficients case with serial correlation is presented in Fair (1970). The formulas in (6.20)–(6.23) for the 2SLS covariance matrix are presented in Fair and Parke (1980). The 3SLS estimator that is based on the minimization of (6.26) is also presented in this paper. The 2SLAD estimator in Section 6.3.6 for q = 1.0 is suggested in Fair (1974c).

The FIML cost savings with respect to the Jacobians that are considered in Section 6.5.2 are discussed in Fair (1976, chap. 3). The estimation of subsets of coefficients by FIML is also discussed in this chapter. The DFP algorithm was used for this earlier FIML work, and it turned out that the "FIML" estimates that are reported in Fair (1976) are not the true FIML estimates. Parke later found using his algorithm a larger value of the likelihood function.

The computational method for the LAD and 2SLAD estimators in Section 6.5.4 is discussed in Fair (1974c).

The possible use of the Hausman test in Section 6.6 to compare the 2SLS, 3SLS, and FIML estimates is discussed in Fair and Parke (1980). The discussion in this paper is misleading in one respect: we failed to point out that the alternative hypothesis that is tested when the 3SLS and FIML estimates are compared for a nonlinear model is that the distribution of the error terms is such as to lead to inconsistent FIML estimates. It was implicitly assumed that any nonnormal distribution meets this requirement, which, as Phillips (1982) has pointed out, is not the case. The Hausman test was used in this paper to compare the 2SLS and 3SLS estimates even though, as we pointed out, the comparison is not valid because of the different sets of first-stage regressors used by 2SLS and 3SLS. The test was applied, where possible, to try to get a feeling for the results, but very little weight was placed on them. For purposes of this book, no attempts have been made to use the Hausman test.

7. Solution

Part of the discussion in this chapter is taken from Fair (forthcoming).

8. Evaluating Predictive Accuracy

The discussion in Sections 8.2 and 8.3 is taken from Fair (forthcoming). The original discussion of the method in Section 8.4 is contained in Fair (1980a). Further discussion of the method and its use can be found in Fair (1979c) and (1982b). The discussion of the d_{itk} values in Section 8.5.2 is similar to that in Fair (1982b), and the comparison of the models in Section 8.5.4 is similar to that in Fair (1979c). The comparison of the MC and ARMC models in Section 8.6 is similar to that in Fair (1981a).

9. Evaluating Static and Dynamic Properties

The original discussion of the stochastic simulation method in Section 9.3 for estimating the uncertainty of policy effects is contained in Fair (1980b). The empirical analysis in Section 9.4.2 is similar to that in Fair (1980b); the analysis in Section 9.4.4 is similar to that in Fair (1978b); and the analysis in Section 9.4.5 is similar to that in Fair and Parke (1980). The empirical results in these sections are not exactly the same as those in the original papers because the US model has been updated for the purposes of this book.

The discussion of the properties of the MC model in Section 9.5 is similar to that in Fair (1982a). The results in this section are not exactly the same as those in the paper because the US and MC models have been updated and because a different set of trade share equations has been used. For the results in the paper the trade share equations in Fair (1981b) were used, whereas for the results in this book the trade share equations in Section 4.2.6 have been used.

10. Optimal Control Analysis

The original discussion of the method in Section 10.2 is in Fair (1974a). The measure of performance in Section 10.3 was first proposed in Fair (1978a). Chow's (1978) comment on this measure contains an error. Chow asserts that because the measure is based on the open-loop approach it assumes that "decisions . . . [are] made once for all four years at the beginning of each administration" (p. 314). This statement is incorrect because the measure is based on the open-loop approach approach and the open-loop approach with reoptimization each period. Furthermore, Chow is not explicit in pointing out that his measure also requires that a new optimization problem be solved each period for a nonlinear model because the linearization changes with each new realization. An attempt was made in Fair (1978a) to approximate the measure of performance by solving fewer

control problems than are actually needed in the complete case. These approximations were then used to compare past U.S. presidential administrations. No attempt has been made to do this here, since it is not clear how good the approximation is.

11. Models with Rational Expectations

The discussion in Sections 11.2, 11.3, 11.4, and 11.6 is based on Fair and Taylor (1983). The analysis in Section 11.7 is similar to that in Fair (1979d). The results in Section 11.7 do not match exactly the results in this paper because the US model has been updated for present purposes and because the experiments are not exactly the same. The experiments differ in the prediction periods used, in the choice of a value of T in (11.20), in the treatment of the initial value of stock prices, and in the treatment of the variable values beyond the end of the data. The discussion of the solution of optimal control problems in Section 11.5 and the estimation of Sargent's model by FIML in Section 11.8 are new.

- Allen, Polly Reynolds. 1973. A portfolio approach to international capital flows. Journal of International Economics 3:135-160.
- Amemiya, Takeshi. 1975. The nonlinear two-stage least squares estimator. *Journal of Econometrics* 2:105-110.

1977. The maximum likelihood and the nonlinear three-stage least squares estimator in the general nonlinear simultaneous equations model. *Econometrica* 45:955–968.

- 1982a. The two stage least absolute deviations estimators. Econometrica 50:689-711.
 - 1982b. Correction to a lemma. Econometrica 50:1325-28.
- Athans, Michael. 1972. The discrete time linear-quadratic-Gaussian stochastic control problem. *Annals of Economic and Social Measurement* 1:449–491.
- Ball, R. J., ed. 1973. *The international linkage of national economic models*. Amsterdam: North-Holland.
- Barro, Robert J. 1976. Rational expectations and the role of monetary policy. *Journal* of Monetary Economics 2:1-32.
- Barro, Robert J., and Herschel I. Grossman. 1971. A general disequilibrium model of income and employment. *American Economic Review* 61:82–93.
- —— 1976. Money, employment and inflation. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Basmann, R. L. 1957. A generalized classical method of linear estimation of coefficients in a structural equation. *Econometrica* 25:77-83.
- Bassett, Gilbert, Jr., and Roger Koenker. 1978. Asymptotic theory of least absolute error regression. *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 73:618-622.
- Berner, Richard, Peter Clark, Howard Howe, et al. 1976. Modeling the international influences on the U.S. economy: A multi-country approach. International Finance Discussion Paper no. 93, Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System.
- Bianchi, Carlo, Giorgio Calzolari, and Paolo Corsi. 1976. Divergences in the results of stochastic and deterministic simulation of an Italian non linear econometric model. In Simulation of systems. ed. L. Dekker. Amsterdam: North-Holland.
- Bierens, Herman J. 1981. Robust methods and asymptotic theory in nonlinear econometrics. Lecture Notes in Economics and Mathematical Systems, vol. 192. Berlin, Heidelberg, and New York: Springer-Verlag.
- Black, Stanley W. 1973. International money markets and flexible exchange rates.

Studies in International Finance, no. 32. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.

- Brainard, William C., and James Tobin. 1968. Pitfalls in financial model building. American Economic Review 58:99-122.
- Branson, William H. 1974. Stocks and flows in international monetary analysis. In International aspects of stabilization policies. ed. A. Ando, R. Herring, and R. Martson, 27-50. Boston: Federal Reserve Bank of Boston.
- Brown, Bryan W. 1981. Sample size requirements in full information maximum likelihood estimation. *International Economic Review* 22:443-459.
- Calzolari, Giorgio, and Paolo Corsi. 1977. Stochastic simulation as a validation tool for econometric models. Paper presented at IIASA Seminar, September 13-15, Laxenburg, Vienna.
- Chow, Gregory C. 1964. A comparison of alternative estimators for simultaneous equations. *Econometrica* 32:532-553.
- —— 1976. The control of nonlinear econometric systems with unknown parameters. *Econometrica* 44:685-695.
- ------ 1980. Estimation of rational expectations models. Journal of Economic Dynamics and Control 2:241-255.
 - 1981. Econometric analysis by control methods. New York: Wiley.
- Chow, Gregory C., and Ray C. Fair. 1973. Maximum likelihood estimation of linear equation systems with auto-regressive residuals. *Annals of Economic and Social Measurement* 2:17-28.
- Chow, Gregory C., and An-loh Lin. 1971. Best linear unbiased interpolation, distribution, and extrapolation of time series by related series. *Review of Economics and Statistics* 53:372-375.
- Christ, Carl F. 1968. A simple macroeconomic model with a government budget restraint. Journal of Political Economy 76:53-67.
- Clower, Robert W. 1965. The Keynesian counterrevolution: A theoretical appraisal. In *The theory of interest rates*, ed. F. H. Hahn and F. P. R. Brechling. London: Macmillan.
- Cochrane, Donald, and Guy Orcutt. 1949. Application of least squares regression to relationships containing autocorrelated error terms. *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 44:32-61.
- Cooper, J. P. 1974. Development of the monetary sector, prediction and policy analysis in the FRB-MIT-Penn model. Lexington, Mass.: D. C. Heath.
- Cooper, J. P., and Stanley Fischer. 1972. Stochastic simulation of monetary rules in two macroeconometric models. *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 67:750-760.
 - 1974. Monetary and fiscal policy in the fully stochastic St. Louis econometric model. *Journal of Money, Credit and Banking* 6:1–22.

- Davidon, W. C. 1959. Variable metric method for minimization. A. E. C. Research and Development Report ANL-5990 (revised).
- Dennis, J. E., Jr., and Jorge J. More. 1977. Quasi-Newton methods, motivation, and theory, SIAM Review 19:46-89.
- Dornbusch, Rudiger. Capital mobility, flexible exchange rates and macroeconomic equilibrium. In *Recent developments in international monetary economics*, ed. E. Claassen and P. Salin, 261–278. Amsterdam: North-Holland.
- Evans, Michael K., Yoel Haitovsky, and George I. Treyz, assisted by Vincent Su. 1972. An analysis of the forecasting properties of U. S. econometric models. In *Econometric models of cyclical behavior*, ed. B. G. Hickman, 949-1139. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Evans, Michael K., Lawrence R. Klein, and Mitsuo Saito. 1972. Short-run prediction and long-run simulation of the Wharton model. In *Econometric models of* cyclical behavior, ed. B. G. Hickman, 139–185. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Fair, Ray C. 1969. The short-run demand for workers and hours. Amsterdam: North-Holland.
 - 1970. The estimation of simultaneous equation models with lagged endogenous variables and first order serially correlated errors. *Econometrica* 38:507– 516.
- 1971a. Sales expectations and short-run production decisions. Southern Economic Journal 37:267-275.
- 1971b. A short-run forecasting model of the United States economy. Lexington, Mass.: D. C. Heath.
- - —— 1974c. On the robust estimation of econometric models. Annals of Economic and Social Measurement 3:667-677.
 - ---- 1974d. A model of macroeconomic activity. Vol. 1, The theoretical model. Cambridge, Mass.: Ballinger.
- ——— 1976. A model of macroeconomic activity. Vol. 2, The empirical model. Cambridge, Mass.: Ballinger.
 - —— 1978a. The use of optimal control techniques to measure economic performance. International Economic Review 19:289-309.

- —— 1979b. On modeling the economic linkages among countries. In International

economic policy: Theory and evidence, ed. R. Dornbusch and J. A. Frenkel, 209-245. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

— 1979c. An analysis of the accuracy of four macroeconometric models. Journal of Political Economy 87:701-718.

— 1979d, An analysis of a macro-econometric model with rational expectations in the bond and stock markets. *American Economic Review* 69:539-552.

- ----- 1980b. Estimating the uncertainty of policy effects in nonlinear models. Econometrica 48:1381-91.

— 1982a. Estimated output, price, interest rate, and exchange rate linkages among countries. Journal of Political Economy 90:507-535.

— 1982b. The effects of misspecification on predictive accuracy. In Evaluating the reliability of macro-economic models, ed. G. Chow and P. Corsi, 193–213. New York: Wiley.

Forthcoming. Evaluating the predictive accuracy of models. In Handbook of Econometrics, ed. Z. Griliches and M. D. Intriligator. Amsterdam: North-Holland.

Fair, Ray C., and William R. Parke. 1980. Full-information estimates of a nonlinear macroeconometric model. *Journal of Econometrics* 13:269-291.

- Fair, Ray C., and John B. Taylor. 1983. Solution and maximum likelihood estimation of dynamic rational expectations models. *Econometrica* 51:1169-85.
- Fisher, Franklin M. 1965. Dynamic structure and estimation in economy-wide econometric models. In *The Brookings quarterly econometric model of the United States*, ed. J. S. Duesenberry, G. Fromm, L. R. Klein, and E. Kuh. Amsterdam: North-Holland.
- Fisher, Franklin, M., Paul H. Cootner, and Martin Neil Baily. 1972. An Econometric Model of the World Copper Industry. *The Bell Journal* 3:568-609.
- Fletcher, R., and M. J. D. Powell. 1963. A rapidly convergent descent method for minimization. *Computer Journal* 6:163-168.
- Frenkel, Jacob A., and Harry G. Johnson, eds. 1976. *The monetary approach to the balance of payments*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Frenkel, Jacob A., and Carlos A. Rodrigues. 1975. Portfolio equilibrium and the balance of payments: A monetary approach. *American Economic Review* 65:674-688.
- Friedman, Milton. 1953. Essays in positive economics. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

^{------ 1981.} The Fair-Parke program for the estimation and analysis of nonlinear econometric models. Mimeo.

—— 1968. The role of monetary policy. American Economic Review 58:1-17.

- Fromm, Gary, and Lawrence R. Klein. 1976. The NBER/NSF model comparison seminar: An analysis of results. Annals of Economic and Social Measurement 5:1-28.
- Fromm, Gary, Lawrence R. Klein, and George R. Schink. 1972. Short- and long-term simulations with the Brookings model. In *Econometric models of cyclical behavior*, ed. B. G. Hickman, 201–292. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Garbade, Kenneth D. 1975. Discretionary control of aggregate economic activity. Lexington, Mass.: D. C. Heath.
- Girton, Lance, and Dale W. Henderson. 1976. Financial capital movements and central bank behavior in a two-country portfolio balance model. *Journal of Monetary Economics* 2:33-61.
- Goldfeld, Stephen M., Richard E. Quandt, and Hale F. Trotter. 1966. Maximization by quadratic-hill-climbing. *Econometrica* 34:541-551.
- Grandmont, Jean Michel. 1977. Temporary general equilibrium theory. *Econometrica* 45:535-572.
- Green, George R., M. Liebenberg, and Albert A. Hirsch. 1972. Short- and longterm simulations with the OBE econometric model. In *Econometric models of cyclical behavior*, ed. B. G. Hickman, 25–123. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Grossman, Herschel I. 1971. Money, interest and prices in market disequilibrium. Journal of Political Economy 79:943-961.

- ———— 1972b. A choice-theoretic model of an income investment accelerator. American Economic Review 62:630-641.
- Haitovsky, Yoel, and George Treyz. 1972. Forecasts with quarterly macroeconometric models, equation adjustments, and benchmark predictions: The U. S. experience. *Review of Economics and Statistics* 54:317-325.
- Haitovsky, Yoel, George Treyz, and Vincent Su. 1974. Forecasts with quarterly macroeconometric models. New York: National Bureau of Economic Research, Columbia University Press.
- Haitovsky, Yoel, and Neil Wallace. 1972. A study of discretionary and nondiscretionary monetary and fiscal policies in the context of stochastic macroeconometric models. In *The business cycle today*, ed. V. Zarnowitz. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Hansen, Lars P., and Thomas J. Sargent. 1980. Formulating and estimating dynamic linear rational expectations models. *Journal of Economic Dynamics and Control* 2:7-46.
 - 1981. Linear rational expectations models for dynamically interrelated variables. In *Rational expectations and econometric practice*, ed. R. E. Lucas, Jr., and T. J. Sargent. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Hausman, Jerry A. 1974. Full information instrumental variables estimation of

^{------ 1972}a. Was Keynes a "Keynesian"? A review article. Journal of Economic Literature 10:26-30.

simultaneous equations systems. Annals of Economic and Social Measurement 3:641-652.

- 1978, Specification tests in econometrics. Econometrica 46:1251-71.
- Hickman, Bert G. 1974. International transmission of economic fluctuations and inflation. In *International aspects of stabilization policies*, ed. A. Ando, R. Herring, and R. Martson. Boston: Federal Reserve Bank of Boston.
- Hirsch, Albert A., Bruce T. Grimm, and Gorti V. L. Narasimham. 1974. Some multiplier and error characteristics of the BEA quarterly model. *International Economic Review* 15:616-631.
- Howrey, E. P., and Harry H. Kelejian. 1971. Simulation versus analytical solutions: The case of econometric models. In *Computer simulation experiments with* models of economic systems, ed. T. H. Naylor. New York: Wiley.
- Huang, H. Y. 1970. Unified approach to quadratically convergent algorithms for function minimization. Journal of Optimization Theory and Applications 5:405-423.
- Intriligator, Michael D. 1978. Econometric models, techniques, and applications. Amsterdam: North-Holland.
- Jorgenson, Dale W., and Jean-Jacques Laffont. 1974. Efficient estimation of nonlinear systems of simultaneous equations with additive disturbances. *Annals of Economic and Social Measurement* 3:615-640.
- Kelejian, Harry H. 1971. Two stage least squares and econometric models linear in the parameters but nonlinear in the endogenous variables. *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 66:373-374.
- Klein, Laurence R. 1971. Forecasting and policy evaluation using large scale econometric models: The state of the art. In *Frontiers of quantitative economics*, ed. M. D. Intriligator. Amsterdam: North-Holland.
- Korliras, Panayotis G. 1972. A disequilibrium macroeconomic model. Mimeo.
- Kouri, Penti J. K. 1976. The exchange rate and the balance of payments in the short run and in the long run. *Scandinavian Journal of Economics 2*:280-304.
- Kydland, Finn E., and Edward C. Prescott. 1977. Rules rather than discretion: The inconsistency of optimal plans. *Journal of Political Economy* 85:473-491.
- Leijonhufvud, Axel. 1968. On Keynesian economics and the economics of Keynes. New York: Oxford University Press.
 - ---- 1973. Effective demand failures. Swedish Journal of Economics 65:27-48.
- Lipton, David, James Poterba, Jeffrey Sachs, and Lawrence Summers. 1982. Multiple shooting in rational expectations models. *Econometrica* 50:1329-33.
- Litterman, Robert B. 1979. Techniques of forecasting using vector autoregression. Working Paper no. 115, Federal Reserve Bank of Minneapolis.
 - 1980. Improving the measurement of predictive accuracy. Mimeo.

Lucas, Robert E., Jr. 1973. Some international evidence on output-inflation tradeoffs. American Economic Review 63:326-334.

--- 1976. Econometric policy evaluation: A critique. In *The Phillips curve and labor markets*, ed. K. Brunner and A. H. Meltzer, 19–46. Amsterdam: North-Holland.

------ 1980. Methods and problems in business cycle theory. Journal of Money, Credit and Banking 11:696-715.

- —— 1981. Tobin and monetarism: A review article. Journal of Economic Literature 19:558-567.
- Lucas, Robert E., Jr., and E. C. Prescott. 1970. Investment under uncertainty. Econometrica 39:659-681.
- Lucas, Robert E., Jr., and Leonard A. Rapping. 1969. Real wages, employment, and the price level. *Journal of Political Economy* 77:721-754.
- Maasoumi, Esfandiar. 1978. A modified Stein-like estimator for the reduced form coefficients of simultaneous equations. *Econometrica* 46:695-703.
- Maccini, Louis J. 1972. The dynamic behavior of prices, output, and inventories. Mimeo.
- Malinvaud, Edmond. 1977. The theory of unemployment reconsidered. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.
- ----- 1980. Profitability and unemployment. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Mansur, Ahsan, and John Whalley. 1981. Numerical specification of applied general equilibrium models: Estimation, calibration, and data. Center for the Study of International Economic Relations, Working Paper no. 8106C, The University of Western Ontario.
- McCallum, Bennett T. 1980. Rational expectations and macroeconomic stabilization policy: An overview. *Journal of Money, Credit and Banking* 11:716-746.
- McCarthy, Michael D. 1971. Notes on the selection of instruments for two stage least squares and k class type estimators. Southern Economic Journal 37:251-259.
 - 1972. Some notes on the generation of pseudo-structural errors for use in stochastic simulation studies. In *Econometric models of cyclical behavior*, ed. B. G. Hickman, 185-191. New York: Columbia University Press.
- McNees, Stephen K. 1973. The predictive accuracy of econometric forecasts. *New England Economic Review* (Sept./Oct.): 3–22.
 - —— 1974. How accurate are economic forecasts? *New England Economic Review* (Nov./Dec.): 2–19.
 - ----- 1975. An evaluation of economic forecasts. *New England Economic Review* (Nov./Dec.): 3-39.
- ———— 1976. An evaluation of economic forecasts: Extension and update. New England Economic Review (Sept./Oct.): 30-44.
- Mortensen, Date T. 1970. A theory of wage and employment dynamics. In E. S.

Phelps et al., *Microeconomic foundations of employment and inflation theory*, 167–211. New York: Norton.

- Muench, Thomas, Arthur Rolnick, Neil Wallace, and William Weiler. 1974. Tests for structural change and prediction intervals for the reduced forms of the two structural models of the U.S.: The FRB-MIT and Michigan quarterly models. *Annals of Economic and Social Measurement* 3:491-519.
- Muth, John F. 1961. Rational expectations and the theory of price movements. *Econometrica* 29:315-335.
- Myhrman, Johan. 1976. Balance-of-payments adjustment and portfolio theory: A survey. In *Recent developments in international monetary economics*, ed. E. Claassen and P. Salin, 203-237. Amsterdam: North-Holland.
- Nagar, A. L. 1969. Stochastic simulation of the Brookings econometric model. In *The Brookings model: Some further results*, ed. J. S. Duesenberry, G. Fromm, L. R. Klein, and E. Kuh. Chicago: Rand McNally.
- Nelson, Charles R. 1972. The prediction performance of the FRB-MIT-PENN model of the U. S. economy. *American Economic Review* 62:902–917.
- Okun, Arthur M. 1971. The personal tax surcharge and consumer demand, 1968–70. Brookings Papers on Economic Activity 1:167–204.
- Parke, William R. 1982a. An algorithm for FIML and 3SLS estimation of large nonlinear models. *Econometrica* 50:81-95.
- ------ 1982b. Two modified FIML estimators for use in small samples. Mimeo.
- Patinkin, Don. 1956. Money, interest, and prices. New York: Harper & Row.
- Phelps, Edmund S. 1967. Phillips curves, expectations of inflation and optimal unemployment over time. *Economica* 34:254-281.
 - 1970. Money wage dynamics and labor market equilibrium. In E. S. Phelps et al., *Microeconomic foundations of employment and inflation theory*, 124–166. New York: Norton.
- Phelps, Edmund S., and Sidney G. Winter, Jr. 1970. Optimal price policy under atomistic competition. In E. S. Phelps et al., *Microeconomic foundations of employment and inflation theory*, 309-337. New York: Norton.
- Phelps, Edmund S., et al. 1970. Microeconomic foundations of employment and inflation theory. New York: Norton.
- Phillips, A. W. 1959. Estimation of parameters in a system of stochastic differential equations. *Biometrika* 46:67-76.
- Phillips, P. C. B. 1982. On the consistency of non-linear FIML. *Econometrica* 50:1307-24.
 - 1984. Exact small sample theory in the simultaneous equations model. In *Handbook of econometrics*, ed. Z. Griliches and M. C. Intriligator. Amsterdam: North-Holland.
- Powell, M. J. D. 1964. An efficient method for finding the minimum of a function of several variables without calculating derivatives. *Computer Journal* 7:155-162.

Sargan, J. D. 1973. The tails of the FIML estimates of the reduced form coefficients. Mimeo.

- Sargent, Thomas J. 1973. Rational expectations, the real rate of interest, and the natural rate of unemployment. *Brookings Papers on Economic Activity* 2:429-480.

- Sargent, Thomas J., and Neil Wallace. 1975. "Rational" expectations, the optimal monetary instrument, and the optimal money supply rule. *Journal of Political Economy* 83:241–254.
- Schink, George R. 1971. Small sample estimates of the variance covariance matrix forecast error for large econometric models: The stochastic simulation technique. Ph.D. diss., University of Pennsylvania.
- Sims, Christopher A. 1980. Macroeconomics and reality. Econometrica 48:1-48.
- Smith, Gary, and William C. Brainard. 1976. The value of a priori information in estimating a financial model. *Journal of Finance 31*:1299-1322.
- Solow, Robert M., and Joseph E. Stiglitz. 1968. Output, employment, and wages in the short run. *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 82:537-560.
- Sowey, E. R. 1973. Stochastic simulation for macroeconomic models: Methodology and interpretation. In *Econometric studies of macro and monetary relations*, ed. A, A, Powell and R. W. Williams, Amsterdam: North-Holland,
- Stigler, George J. 1961. The economics of information. *Journal of Political Economy* 69:213–225.
- Taylor, John B. 1977. Conditions for unique solutions in stochastic macroeconomic models with rational expectations. *Econometrica* 45:1377-86.
 - 1980. Output and price stability: An international comparison. Journal of Economic Dynamics and Control 2;109–132.
- Theil, Henri. 1953. Repeated least-squares applied to complete equations systems. The Hague: Central Planning Bureau.

----- 1966. Applied economic forecasting. Amsterdam: North-Holland.

- Tishler, Asher, and Israel Zang. 1981. An absolute deviations curve fitting algorithm for non-linear models. Mimeo.
- Tobin, James. 1969. A general equilibrium approach to monetary theory. *Journal of Money, Credit and Banking* 1:15–29.

^{— 1975.} Asymptotic theory and large models. *International Economic Review* 16:75–91.

- - —— 1982. Money and finance in the macroeconomic process. *Journal of Money*, *Credit, and Banking 14*:171–204.
- Tucker, Donald P. 1968. Credit rationing, interest rate lags, and monetary policy speed. *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 82:54-84.
 - —— 1971a. Macroeconomic models and the demand for money under market disequilibrium. *Journal of Money, Credit, and Banking 3*:57–83.
- Wallis, Kenneth F. 1980. Econometric implications of the rational expectations hypothesis. *Econometrica* 48:49-74.
- Zarnowitz, Victor, 1979. An analysis of annual and multiperiod quarterly forecasts of aggregate income, output, and the price level. *Journal of Business* 52:1-33.

Index

add factors, 256, 263 Allen, Polly Reynolds, 97 Amemiya, Takeshi, 211, 217, 218, 220, 222, 223 applied general equilibrium models, 17-18 Athans, Michael, 40 autoregressive model, 199 Baily, Martin Neil, 213 balance-sheet constraints, 39, 97, 104-105 Ball, R. J., 152 bank behavior, 72, 142 Barro, Robert J., 37, 94, 96, 406 Basmann, R. L., 223 Bassett, Gilbert, Jr., 222 Berner, Richard, 152 BFGS algorithm, 31, 368 Bianchi, Carlo, 256 Bierens, Herman J., 211 Black, Stanley W., 97 Brainard, William C., 40, 41, 407 Branson, William H., 97 Brown, Bryan W., 225 Burns, Arthur, 148 Calzolari, Giorgio, 256 Chow, Gregory C., 11, 20, 221, 355, 356, 357, 363-364, 370, 464 Christ, Carl F., 39, 94 Clower, Robert W., 35 Cochrane, Donald, 212 computer times, 7-8; theoretical model, 47, 63, 82; trade share equations, 197; 2SLS, 227-230; OLS, 230; FIML, 235; 3SLS, 238; LAD, 241; 2SLAD, 241; stochastic simulation, 257, 285, 313; MC model, 259-260, 296; successive reestimation and stochastic simulation, 278-279; optimal control problems, 368: rational expectations models, 386-388, 393, 401-402 Cooper, J. P., 256

Cootner, Paul H., 213 Corsi, Paolo, 256 Davidon, W. C., 29, 31 degrees of freedom, 6-7demand pressure variable: in US model, 111-112; in MC model, 162 Dennis, J. E., Jr., 31 deterministic simulations, 248, 301-303 DFP algorithm, 29-34, 238, 367-368, 386-388 disequilibrium, 23, 35-39, 90, 109-111 Dornbusch, Rudiger, 97 Evans, Michael K., 255, 263 ex ante forecasts, 248, 262-264 excess capital, 51-52, 112-114, 134-137 cxcess labor, 51-52, 112-114, 132-134 exchange rate determination, 99-101, 154-155, 183-187 exchange rate effect on inflation, 348-350 exogenous variable uncertainty, 266-268, 285 expectation errors, 90 expectations, 20-23; in theoretical model, 39-40, 56-59; in US model, 106-109; in MC model, 162 ex post forecasts, 248, 264-265 firm behavior, 51-71, 124-141 first stage regressors, 215-216, 218-219, 244 fiscal policy, 148, 319-323 Fischer, Stanley, 256 Fisher, Franklin M., 213, 215 fixed price equilibria, 37-39 Fletcher, R., 29, 31 Frenkel, Jacob A., 97 Friedman, Milton, 15, 27 Fromm, Garv, 256, 264 full information maximum likelihood, 11, 219-221, 230-235, 241-247, 324; for rational expectations models, 381-384

Garbade, Kenneth D., 256 Gauss-Seidel technique, 32, 47, 249-252, 254, 257, 259 Girton, Lance, 97 Goldfeld, Stephen M., 31 government behavior, 73-74, 145-148 Grandmont, Jean Michel, 37 Green, George R., 256 Grimm, Bruce T., 263 Grossman, Herschel I., 37, 406 Haitovsky, Yoel, 256, 263, 267 Hansen, Lars P., 11-14, 370, 379 Hausman, Jerry A., 221, 245, 246-247, 463 Hausman test, 246-247 Henderson, Dale W., 97 Hickman, Bert G., 152 Hirsch, Albert A., 256, 263 household behavior, 43-51, 114-124 Howrey, E. P., 249 Huang, H. Y., 31 inequality coefficient, 261 Intriligator, Michael D., 256 IS-LM model, 93-94 Jacobi technique, 250 J-curve effect, 329 Johnson, Harry G., 97 Jorgenson, Dale W., 217 Kelejian, Harry H., 211, 249 Klein, Lawrence R., 255, 256, 264 Koenker, Roger, 222 Korliras, Panayotis, 37 Kouri, Penti J. K., 97 Kydland, Finn E., 385 labor constraint variable, 109-111 Laffont, Jean-Jacques, 217 least absolute deviations, 222, 238-243, 292 - 295Leijonhufvud, Axel, 35 Liebenberg, M., 256 Lin, An-loh, 20 linkages among countries, 97-99, 161, 326 - 327

Lipton, David, 374 Litterman, Robert B., 274 long-run constraints, 15-16, 90-91

long-run quality of models, 28 Lucas, Robert E., Jr., 11-14, 15, 94, 95, 371, 407 Lucas's point, 11-14 Maasoumi, Esfandiar, 254 Maccini, Louis J., 38 Malinvaud, Edmond, 37, 38 Mansur, Ahsan, 17 McCarthy, Michael D., 216, 255 McNees, Stephen K., 262, 263 mean absolute errors, 261, 293-295 measure of performance, 358-364 misspecification, 268-274, 295 moments, possible nonexistence of, 253-255, 258-259, 291-292 monetary policy, 148-150, 319-323 More, Jorge J., 31 Mortensen, Dale T., 38 Muench, Thomas, 256 multiplier, definition of, 301 Muth, John F., 7 Myhrman, Johan, 97 Nagar, A. L., 255, 256 Narasimham, Gorti V. L., 263 Nelson, Charles R., 265 Newton's method, 30 nonlinear optimization algorithms, 28-34 Okun, Arthur M., 414 Okun's law, 92, 308 optimal control problems: a method of solution, 352-354; Chow's method, 356-357; for US model, 364-367; for rational expectations models, 385-386 Orcutt, Guy, 212 ordinary least squares, 210, 227-230, 241-243, 292-295, 324 Parke algorithm, 32, 231-232, 233-235, 238, 401-402 Parke, William R., 224-225, 226, 231, 232, 443.463 Patinkin, Don, 35 Phelps, Edmund S., 15, 37, 38, 90-91 Phillips, A. W., 14 Phillips curve, 92 Phillips, P. C. B., 220, 253, 463, 464 pitfalls approach, 40-43

Powell, M. J. D., 29, 31, 238 predictive accuracy, method for evaluating, 265-274; used to compare five models, 286 - 290Prescott, E. C., 371, 385 putty-clay technology, 51, 52, 113 Quandt, Richard E., 32 Rapping, Leonard A., 95 rational expectations: definition of, 7; in bond and stock markets, 390-399; possible test of, 399 rational expectations models: a class of, 94-96; Sargent's model, 204-207, 399-404; solution of, 371-378; estimation of, 381-384 real interest rates: estimation of, 107-109; effects of, 120 real wage constraint, 125 restrictions on coefficients. 214-215 Rodrigues, Carlos A., 97 Rolnick, Arthur, 256 root mean squared errors, 261, 288-290, 292-295, 296-300, 402-403 Saito, Mitsuo, 255 sample size requirements, 224-226 Sargan, J. D., 224, 253 Sargent, Thomas J., 11-14, 94, 96, 204-207, 369, 370, 379, 399-404, 410, 465 Sargent's model, 204-207, 399-404 Schink, George R., 256 serial correlation, 208-210, 211-214 significance, definition of, 6 Sims, Christopher A., 14-15 Smith Gary, 41 Solow, Robert M., 37 Sowey, E. R., 256 Stigler, George J., 37 Stiglitz, Joseph E., 37

stochastic simulations, 249, 252-253, 255-256, 257-259, 303-305, 354-355, 383 - 384subsets of coefficients, 225-227 Su. Vincent. 256 Taylor, John B., 370, 379, 380, 386, 465 Theil, Henri, 216-217, 223, 261 theoretical simulation models, 16-18 theory: traditional role, 10-11; approach of Hansen-Sargent, 11-14; approach of Sims, 14-15; long-run constraints imposed, 15-16; testing, 26-27 three-stage least squares, 11, 217-219, 221, 235-238, 241-247, 292-295, 324 time inconsistency, 385 Tishler, Asher, 240-241 Tobin. James. 15, 40-43, 407 trade share equations, 196-198 transition from theoretical to econometric models, 18-26 Treyz, George, 256, 263 Trotter, Hale F., 32 Tucker, Donald P., 37 two-stage least absolute deviations, 222-223, 238-243, 292-295, 324 two-stage least squares, 11, 210-217, 227-230, 241-244, 247, 292-295, 324 vector autoregressive models, 14-15, 200 - 201Volcker, Paul, 147, 407 Wallace, Neil, 94, 96, 256, 267 Wallis, Kenneth F., 370 Weiler, William, 256 Whalley, John, 17 Winter, Sidney G., Jr., 38, 90-91

Zang, Israel, 240-241 Zarnowitz, Victor, 262